Giving and receiving feedback is an essential skill in collaborative work.

This lesson was written and provided by Janet Kerby, NBCT, Roane County High School, Spencer, West Virginia.

**Enduring Understanding**

The ability to give, receive and act upon constructive feedback is an essential skill in workplace situations that involve collaborative work by a production team.

**Essential Questions**

What are effective methods of providing feedback among members of a team? How can the feedback be translated into a plan for improvement?

**Objectives and Outcome**

- Students will be able to identify strengths and weaknesses of a given product or production process at the present level of skill mastery.
- Students will be able to provide written feedback to other team members using suggested models and techniques.
- Students will be able to interpret feedback received from other team members and set an appropriate, measurable goal for acting on the feedback.

**Suggested Time**

This lesson will span two days to allow for modeling and writing on the first day and receiving feedback and setting goals on the second day. This lesson would be used after students have some degree of basic skill mastery and can recognize specific strengths and weaknesses. This approach is best presented after students have completed more than one team activity. This activity can and should be repeated a few times to allow students to become comfortable with the process.

**Resources and Materials**

“Making the Team Work” in the Fall 2002 NewsLab Report available at http://www.newslab.org/newsletter.htm. This article is a confirmation that teamwork is essential in the broadcasting industry.
Procedure

1. Ask students to respond to the following questions:
   - What are some scenarios in which groups discuss their strengths, weaknesses, responsibilities and strategies? Meetings of club officers, teams in sports, and faculty are some responses.
   - What are some situations in the broadcasting industry when teamwork is important? Student responses may include studio newscasts, a reporter/photographer team, and a pre-production meeting.
   - What are some situations, comments and conditions that could cause a team not to work effectively? A member lacking skills; expression of jealousy or excessive pride; telling of racial, ethnic or gender jokes; too many leaders, and members not carrying their part of the load are among possible responses.

2. After discussion, in small groups have students list some ways a member of a production team can be a strong contributor and some ways that a member might limit the effectiveness of the team. Give a very short time limit, perhaps three to five minutes. Each team member should have a role; for example, in a group of three, one will be secretary, one will be leader of discussion and one will report to the class. This will get students thinking about some of the behaviors and skills that might be addressed in feedback.


4. Ask students to provide feedback to every member of their production team. Each student and the teacher are expected to give constructive feedback in a short paragraph to each of the other members of the team.

   Avoid handwriting. Use computers and a printer. The teacher collects all feedback from the printer so anonymity is protected. Make students aware of the process and its anonymous nature. The teacher may ask students to type their own names at the top so the teacher can see if the writer is grasping the techniques that were discussed. If students know the teacher will read and know the author, they are more likely to give valid comments. After the teacher collects the documents from the printer, he or she cuts the various paragraphs into slips and sorts for distribution to students.

5. Distribute the anonymous feedback to the students along with the “Goal Setting After Peer Feedback” and an envelope. Allow sufficient time for reflective writing after students read their feedback paragraphs. As directed on the handout, students will seal their writing in the envelope with a date for opening. NOTE: The teacher may wish to say that the goal setting dates must be within two weeks, a month, or by end of the term. Work with short-term goals so they can see success soon.

Homework

This activity does not require an extension through a homework assignment unless the individual student’s setting of goals involves something that is done outside class.
Assessment

This lesson is not related to a grade and that is important to establish. Teachers may give participation credit to encourage full involvement in the activity. The only assessment by the teacher (if desired) is that the teacher will read the feedback written by each student to see if, in general, students are following the model and are correctly identifying strengths and weaknesses. The most important assessment in this lesson is the self-assessment and goal-setting by each student.

Academic Content Standards

National Standard
Know and apply appropriate criteria to arts and communication products. (McREL, Arts & Communication Career, Standard 2)

National Benchmark
Know the process of critiquing one’s own work and the work of others (e.g., making choices, forming judgements, expressing preferences based on personal and art criticism criteria). (McREL, Arts & Communication, Grades 9-12)

Know the basic terminology used in the process of evaluation (e.g., intent, structure, effectiveness, value). (McREL, Arts & Communication, Grades 9-12)

Industry Standards and Expectations

Identify and demonstrate positive work behaviors and personal qualities. (F09.2, Career Cluster Project: Communications Skills)

Use Collaborative/Groupware applications (F04.8, Career Cluster Project: Communications Skills)

Apply teamwork knowledge and skills to group situations to achieve collective goals. (Washington State CTE Model Curriculum Framework)
Tips For Giving Feedback

First course, Second grading period, Week 7

1. Concentrate on praise. Don’t use “but”; use “and” or “although” construction. For example, “Although I really enjoyed my stay at your hotel, I would have enjoyed it more if I had been able to watch The West Wing.” “I think your show was very well planned and I would have liked to hear the reporter with the principal ask why the new rule about locker use was put into effect.”

2. Look forward. Don’t get “shouldy.” Don’t do “should have.” Don’t look back. For example, “I think your camerawork on the news package was well done. In your next production, I think you’re ready to move beyond the basics and ready to be a little more creative and not quite so predictable with your camera shots.” That’s much better than “You should have used some different shots. All your stories look exactly the same.” The first statement helps the person to set specific goals for improvement in the next project.

3. Be precise. Avoid generalities in feedback. Avoid “Nobody likes to watch a story like that,” or “Everybody knows you can’t do something like that.” Who is NOBODY? What is THAT? Who is EVERYONE? It’s better to say “The Channel 22 staff has never produced a music video before, but I’ll bet we could as long as we deal with the legalities.” “Although that’s not my favorite type of story, I think many of the viewers might like it especially if you could include angles like ….” This is a good technique to use with a student who has personal characteristics that get in the way of his being a “team player.” Don’t say, “I don’t want Joe on my team because he can’t do anything.” Better: “Joe’s contribution on the team is limited because he needs to improve his ability to operate the camera properly. When he has to redo so many shots, it takes up time with the rest of the team.”

4. When giving a rule or a “command/request,” add perspective and consequences, to any restrictions imposed. This applies to the teacher, a director or producer or it could also apply to students presenting their opinions in a team atmosphere where decision-making is taking place. For example, “We can’t shoot from the top of the press box.” Don’t stop there. “… because it’s raining and if we shoot from there, our expensive camera will be damaged.” Or “You can’t shoot that shot in front of the window because if you do, the backlighting will cause the reporter to look like a silhouette.”

5. Avoid ambiguity. Give concrete details and suggestions. Don’t say, “You should have longer stories.” What story are you critiquing and what should be included to make it longer? “I would have gotten into your interview with the principal more if you had asked questions which really pinned him down like more ‘why’ questions. Most of what you got in answers was just information I already knew.”

6. Comparison is a tool to use effectively and adds specifics to an otherwise general statement. Don’t say, “Joe’s story about school rules is boring.” Boring compared to what? Compare to something. A better way is to say, “Joe’s story about school rules is not as interesting as the one James did about proposed changes because Joe didn’t tell me anything I didn’t already know and James uncovered a lot that was new to me.” Don’t stop with “Jane is a great anchor.” Compared to whom? “Jane is a great anchor. I can see that she’s picked up some tips on phrasing and eye contact from watching Katie Couric.”
Goal-setting After Peer Feedback

Read the enclosed comments from your class. Answer these questions quickly but thoughtfully.

1. In your own words, state what seems to be your main strength judging from the feedback your class and I gave you.

2. In your own words, what one area needs to be improved? State a SPECIFIC improvement you could make based on the feedback you have received.
(SPECIFIC means a definite, attainable, measurable goal. At a date determined by you, we could look at this paper and say beyond a doubt that you have achieved this goal. We would have evidence from your attitude, skills and projects to prove it. This does not have to be a huge undertaking, just one that is attainable and observable.)

3. Write a plan in steps to achieve what you described in # 2. Put a goal date after each step. Put the steps on your calendar in your folder. Then seal this sheet in the envelope. On the outside under your name, write the date WE will open it to celebrate that you met your goal. Give the envelope to me.
Guidelines and rubrics give students a clear understanding of what is expected of them and how they performed on assignments.

This lesson was written and provided by Janet Kerby, NBCT, Roane County High School, Spencer, West Virginia.

Enduring Understanding

Students will be better able to meet high expectations when they have a clear understanding of the characteristics of excellence associated with those expectations.

Essential Question

How do we construct and apply a rubric for the purpose of judging the quality of a product?

Objectives and Outcome

- Students will be able to identify and describe in appropriate terms the characteristics by which the quality of a product and/or skill mastery is judged.
- Students will be able to consistently apply a rubric to a given product for self-assessment.
- Students will be able to generate suggestions for improving a product to meet characteristics of excellence.

Suggested Time

One day

Resources and Materials

Resources would be sample rubrics available as grading tools in texts. Materials required would be at least one example of a teacher-made rubric. One example is included with this plan. It is important that the rubric reflect the appropriate level of skill mastery and the expectations of the product at that level.

Procedure

1. In collaborative groups or as whole class, take no more than five minutes to ask students to compile a list of characteristics that make an “excellent” person they’d want to ask for a date. What would make a person less desirable? What would make a person unacceptable? If you aren’t comfortable with this topic, choose what makes a good music video or some other teen topic.
Included with this lesson is a sample for judging the performance of a football team. If this rubric is used, you can add objectives to accomplish word processing skills, such as changing font color and attaching a Word document to an e-mail.

2. The lower portion of “Sample Rubric for Judging a Team’s Performance” might be used to further this exercise and develop students’ participation in establishing standards and expectations. The end-of-term project that students will complete in the next weeks is a 3-minute newscast.

   Explain that we make choices every day by judging characteristics and expectations. The class will devise an instrument to judge its work and to evaluate what makes it “excellent.”

3. Create a student-made rubric. Insist that the rubric use subject-specific vocabulary.

4. As a class, decide on an expectation of excellence. After establishing the final form of the document, make copies.

5. Apply the rubric to at least three products which are not of the same quality and do not have the same strengths and weaknesses, to see if students are correctly identifying requirements and evaluating them.

Homework

No homework is necessary unless at a later date, a student listens to a product at home and applies the rubric. A written evaluation or explanation could be required following the rubric.

Assessment

Teacher observation during the rubric creation and application. In addition to judging students’ understanding of the rubric process, the teacher will be able to observe students’ mastery of vocabulary and also their mastery of concepts that affect the quality of the product. This lesson is most important as a self and peer assessment.

One class period will be needed to introduce the concept of constructing a rubric and the actual construction process. Once this is done, the activity is repeated as needed for self or peer critiques. Various rubrics may be developed in this manner to cover different products or different stages of skill mastery.

Academic Content Standards

National Standard
Know and apply appropriate criteria to arts and communication products. (McREL, Arts & Communication Career, Standard 2)

National Benchmark
Know criteria used to evaluate and select different media productions (e.g., personal preferences for television programming). (McREL, Arts & Communication, Grades 6-8)
Know the process of critiquing one’s own work and the work of others (e.g., making choices, forming judgements, expressing preferences based on personal and art criticism criteria). (McREL, Arts & Communication, Grades 9-12)

Know the basic terminology used in the process of evaluation (e.g., intent, structure, effectiveness, value). (McREL, Arts & Communication, Grades 9-12)

Industry Standards and Expectations

Use Collaborative/Groupware applications (F04.8, Career Cluster Project: Communications Skills)

Apply teamwork knowledge and skills to group situations to achieve collective goals. (Washington State CTE Model Curriculum Framework)
### Sample Rubric for Judging a Team’s Performance

*Directions:* Look at the sample rubric below. Notice that the categories represent different areas in which a team’s performance in a game MIGHT be judged. Attempt to fill in the blank blocks with what you think should go there. Make your font a different color than black.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>EXCELLENT</th>
<th>GOOD</th>
<th>AVERAGE</th>
<th>UNACCEPTABLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Final score</td>
<td>Team won by more than 20 points</td>
<td>Team won by 10-19 points</td>
<td>Team won by 1-9 points</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Play Execution</td>
<td>All players knew positions and executed on all plays</td>
<td>No more than 2 penalties and none affected score</td>
<td>Penalties led to scoring by other team</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure</td>
<td>No penalties</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Your First Rubric for Judging First Team Newscast

*Directions:* Identify the categories that you think would be used to judge the quality of a radio newscast. Then define in each box, the various degrees of success in that category. Be as specific as possible as the purpose of this is to see what concepts you’ve grasped and can apply to evaluation of your own work. When you finish, save this file as a Word document and e-mail it to your teacher. Also print a hard copy for us to use in class discussion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CATEGORY</th>
<th>EXCELLENT</th>
<th>GOOD</th>
<th>AVERAGE</th>
<th>UNACCEPTABLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>